
The Effectiveness of Reciprocal Teaching Method on Students' Reading Comprehension in Descriptive Text

Alfina Abrori¹, Muhammad Hifdil Islam², Beny Hamdani^{3*}

^{1,2}English Educational Department, Faculty of Educational Scientific and Teaching, Zainul Hasan Genggong Islamic University, Indonesia

Abstract

This research aims to investigate whether the students who are taught reading in descriptive text through Reciprocal Teaching Method achieve better in reading ability than those who are taught through Conventional Teaching Method and to explain about the advantages that students will get when using Reciprocal Teaching Method in improving students' reading comprehension . The design of this study was quasi experimental, control class, pretest-posttest because it was conducted in two classrooms. The subjects of the study are tenth grade high school students consisting of 28 students in MAN 2 Probolinggo. They are divided into two classes, namely control class consists of 14 students and experimental class consists of 14 students. The data analysis used Independent T-Test. Based on the result of the calculation of post-test from experimental and control groups, the alternative hypothesis (Ha) was accepted. The result of the study shows that the use of the Reciprocal Teaching Method can improve the students' reading ability. The Reciprocal Teaching Method gives the students more advantages in improving reading skills compared to Conventional Teaching Method. It proves the hypothesis of the study that students who are taught reading through the Reciprocal Teaching method achieve better in reading ability than those who are taught through Conventional Teaching Method. With the advantages gained from the Reciprocal Teaching Method, students can easily to understand and improve their reading ability. Based on this result, it can be concluded that the Reciprocal Teaching Method can be used as an alternative method to teach reading, so that the students are able to understand the texts

^{1*}Corresponding author, email: benyhamdani.ielts9.consultation@gmail.com

Citation in APA style: Abrori, A., Hifdil Islam, M., & Hamdani, B. (2023). The Effectiveness of Reciprocal Teaching Method on Students' Reading Comprehension in Descriptive Text. *JADEs Journal of Academia in English Education*, 4(1), 71-88. <https://doi.org/10.32505/jades.v3i2/4451>

Submitted: Feb 15, 2023; **Accepted:** Jun 26, 2023; **Published:** Jul 3, 2023

comprehensively. It also makes the students more active in the teaching learning process and can improve their ability as well.

Keywords: Reading; reciprocal teaching method; descriptive text.

1. INTRODUCTION

English has been the first foreign language taught in the senior high school in Indonesia since 1946, a year after its independence in 1945, which means that the teaching of English as a foreign language (TEFL) in Indonesia has run for almost 75 years (A. Prayogo, 2022). In general, there are four language processes that work together to enhance each other's development: speaking, listening, reading, and writing. Listening and reading are processes of retrieving information, and speaking and writing are processes of providing information. In addition, according to (Moreillon, 2007), reading makes meaning from print as well as from visual information. Reading is an active process that requires a lot of practice and skill.

Reading is one of the important skills that must be learned, as it can affect other language skills. If the students don't have reading skills, it is considered that they will not have the ability to listen, speak and write. The relationship between reading and writing is the initial process of training to improve oral language skills so as to develop written language skills in literary form. The relationship between reading and speaking can help improve spoken language and help students better understand what they hear (Pangaribuan, 2019). Reading is very important for students, as there are many advantages to learning reading. According to (Harmer, 1998) "Reading is useful for language acquisition". Based on this definition, reading is the mastery of language to communicate among other readers. Reading also has a positive effect on students '

vocabulary knowledge, on their spelling and on their writing. To get information, people have to read a wide variety of information. Reading is a source of information. No one can get a lot of information without reading, because reading can help to know simple information to more complex.

The purpose of teaching and learning English is to develop students' understanding of the English language. It concerns the creation of oral and written texts. It also consists of four integrated skills, namely listening, speaking, reading and writing that students need to acquire in school. Since students own and use English textbooks written in English at school, it is important for them to be able to read some types of texts in English, understand, and focus on reading skills. Reading has many reasons to be an important skill in learning English because reading helps readers and students learn and understand a new language, subsequently they will gain new vocabulary and improve their knowledge.

However, students sometimes have difficulty reading texts and understanding about English texts, not least to understand descriptive texts. Based on the grand tour, researchers found that many students had difficulty in reading. Some of the problems are, students are lazy to read, Students only read the text but do not understand what the topic means, and students do not have enough vocabulary. This makes the students have a little difficulty.

To overcome these problems, one way that can be applied is to use learning methods that will be effective if used. One method that can be used is reciprocal teaching method. According to (Oczkus, 2018), reciprocal teaching is a scaffolded discussion method built on the development of four strategies used to understand the text, namely

Predicting, Questioning, Clarifying and Summarizing. Reciprocal teaching method as a good method to solve problems, is because the reciprocal teaching method is in accordance with the characteristics of students who better understand learning by discussion methods and techniques of reciprocal teaching method is very easy to understood and mastered.

According to (Oczkus, 2018), reciprocal teaching as an effective practice that improves students reading comprehension. Reciprocal teaching is a supportive teaching practice because this method can be supports students to develop comprehension strategies in a supportive context, makes explicit what readers do- predict, clarify, question and summaries, then develops students' content knowledge and topic vocabulary, can be fosters meaningful dialogue among students including extended talk about texts, and last is helps students to develop skills in locating, recording, and organizing information in preparation for writing. In order for students to understand the content of the reading well, the teacher must use interesting teaching method. Therefore, a strategy that provides a better way to score reading subjects is through reciprocal teaching method.

The application of reciprocal teaching method is that the teacher and the student take turn leading a dialogue centered on relevant text in their studying. This method guides the student to interact with the text in sophisticated ways of learning process. This Strategy will make the students easily to understand about the information and meaning in the text by predicting because they will think about content of the text, is it make sense or not, so students get new vocabularies from the text. In Clarifying activity, the teacher and students clarify all things that found in the text from difficult vocabulary, main idea, etc. In questioning

activity, the teacher asks some questions to the students to know how far students understanding about the text or on the contrary, students can ask to teacher about the text that they do not understand it. In Summarizing activity, the students learn to find the main idea of the text and they should write the important point and conclusion by using their own language. Reciprocal teaching strategy will also lead to improvement in learning process especially in reading comprehension activities.

Descriptive text is one of the texts that must be learned by the tenth grade of high school. Descriptive text is text that describes something, person, thing, event, or place. Descriptive text provides detailed explanations, so that readers understand the object of information they are looking for. Descriptive has two text structure, that is identification and description. Identification contains an introduction or explanation of the thing to be described, while the description section contains a clear and specific explanation of the characteristics, properties, habits or other things related to the object to be described.

Based on observation and the result interview with English teacher at MAN 2 Probolinggo, the teacher said that the learning materials of tenth grade students had arrived at Descriptive text materials. So, the researcher wants to know whether the Reciprocal Teaching Method would have a major effect on improving students' reading comprehension in Descriptive text materials.

An analysis of similar studies was carried out by those who were tested on Narrative text material. It was found that the Reciprocal Teaching Method has an effect on improving students' ability by comparing T_{test} and T_{table} ($2,370 > 1,697$). There is significant difference between the students who is taught by using Reciprocal Teaching as the

method and the students who are not taught using Reciprocal Teaching Strategy (Islamiyah & Wijaya, 2019). Students are motivated and active in the classroom by using Reciprocal Teaching Method to work together and help each other in groups with different competencies, which is shown from the results of their work (Islam, 2020). That way, the researcher want to know whether the use Reciprocal Teaching Method on Descriptive text material will also affect the improvement of students' reading comprehension. This study need to be realizes to find accurate information and data.

In this study, the researcher focused the application of this reciprocal teaching method on reading comprehension in descriptive texts. This study aims to: (1) To find out if reciprocal teaching method are effective in improving students ' reading comprehension in Descriptive texts. (2) To explain the advantages of using reciprocal teaching method in improving students' reading comprehension in descriptive text

2. LITERATURE REVIEW

2.1 The Reciprocal Teaching Method

Reciprocal teaching is a research-based instructional strategy created by Palincsar & Brown to help students improve their reading comprehension skills (Pilonieta & Medina, 2009). Reciprocal teaching is frequently administered by teachers as a pre-determined set of processes, with little knowledge of why the strategies work (Young, 2002). Therefore, it is concluded that reciprocal teaching is an outstanding role-playing learning strategy that has been proven to improve reading and comprehension. Reciprocal teaching is best described as a conversation between teachers and students in which each participant takes turns acting as the teacher.

2.1.1 The Purpose of Reciprocal Teaching Method

Pallinscar and Brown stated that, while students and teacher apply reciprocal teaching procedure, its purpose that “The teacher prompts and shapes the student's participation by using corrective feedback” (Annemarie Pallinscar and Anna Brown, 1985). It means that, the teacher as guidance to maintain the activity and to give respond correctively in the classroom.

Moreover, Farris researched that “Careful supervision and practice will help students to master the steps in an educationally interactive dialogue” (Pamela J. Farris, Carol J. Fuhler, 2003). In this point, students can develop their understanding the steps within the dialogue between the teacher and the students.

Meanwhile, Cotterall assumed that “reciprocal teaching involves students in using the target language to debate ideas and interpretations, encouraging them to call on their knowledge of the world, their previous experiences of reading and their knowledge to help them make sense of the text” (Cotterall, 1990). In this sense, reciprocal teaching also invites the students to predict and think in target language as they read in text.

To conclude, the purpose of reciprocal teaching technique is to build comprehension and give corrective feedback used by teacher and students cooperatively in dialogue.

2.1.2 The Strategy of Reciprocal Teaching Method

Palinscar and Brown explain that the main instructional technique used to teach the four activities is an interactive dialogue in which the teacher explicitly models each of the four activities. The students follow the teacher's model by engaging in the same activities. Teachers solicit and shape student's participation by using corrective feedback.

Furthermore, Farris stated that the steps consist of four steps as follows:

2. Predictions

At first, students and teachers look at aspects such as the story title, introduction, and title. After that, the teacher lets the student activate his previous knowledge to predict about the text. The students are encouraged to speculate freely what the author's might be discussing. In addition, they add, teachers take notes and refer to them as the class progresses via text. It can be displayed when the teacher writes students prediction and provide clues when the interaction

3. Questioning

The next step the student reads silently to know the main idea of the paragraph. After reading, they formulate about the unclear part of this paragraph. In addition, Farris States, " as an examination of understanding of what they read, students at that time formulate questions about the content." Here is after reading the students ask questions about the reading section to ensure their understanding.

4. Seeking clarification

Then, teachers and students find answers in the text that they feel confused. Teacher participation and getting together to seek clarification during group discussions are steps to ensure readers engage with the text. Aspects when the clarification process Farris States, both teachers and students pay attention to vocabulary, unusual expressions, concepts or other information that may be confusing. This activity concerns linguistic aspects and many things related to texts.

4) Summary

The final step is the students focus what is an important part of the whole story. Here, the students indicate the main focus of the text. Furthermore, Farris adds that in this case initially the teacher as leader summarizes the text and the subsequent explanation comes from the

chosen group leader involving the main part of the text. This means, the teacher is not only the summarizer but also the student, as well (Pamela J. Farris, Carol J. Fuhler, 2003).

In summary, the four steps of the above reciprocal teaching technique are described in the classroom cooperatively between teacher and student. The goal is to encourage students to predict and ask questions about the text or story.

2.2 The Conventional Teaching Method

As a comparison material in this study, researchers compare Reciprocal Teaching Method with other teaching learning method, that is conventional teaching methods. Conventional teaching methods or often referred to as the classical learning approach is a teaching pattern that emphasizes the authority of teachers in learning. This teaching method is the learning pattern that is currently most used by teachers. In conventional teaching methods, students listen to teacher's explanation in front of the class and do assignments when the teacher gives practice questions.

According to (Syaiful Bahri Djamarah, 2006), conventional teaching methods are traditional teaching methods or also called the lecture method, because since the first this method has been used as a means of oral communication between teachers and students in the learning process. In learning the history of the conventional method is characterized by lectures accompanied by explanations and division of tasks and exercises characterized by lectures accompanied by explanations and division of tasks and exercises.

2.2.1 The Purpose of Conventional Teaching Method

In the Conventional Teaching Method, the main objective is to shape behaviors based on a predetermined model, wherein teachers play

the central and essential roles (Afrasiabifar et al., 2020). The Conventional Teaching Method is an appropriate channel for providing basic information and transferring experimental sciences, as the most effective teaching method in some cases. Although this method is easy-to-implemented and cost-effective with a long history in education systems, it has some drawbacks such as low flexibility, inactivity, rapid forgetting of materials, fatigue, high rate of absenteeism, and no motivation (Afrasiabifar et al., 2020).

2.2.2 The Strategy of Conventional Teaching Method

According to (Mahur et al., 2019), this conventional teaching pattern leads to a type of Education termed “bank”, where students are filled and crammed with diverse subject matter. Students only apply to receive everything that has been and will be prepared by the teacher without any other critical activity.

Conventional Teaching Method is a teacher focused technique. In the Conventional Teaching Method are defined as being teacher-arranged, in a speech style and are firm. Lessons are typically educated by the teacher presenting skills utilizing a blackboard joined by a verbal clarification or lecture. Conventional Teaching Method tends greatly toward class address book knowledge through repetition and retention of actualities, equivalences and formulas. Recitation as a general rule comprises repeating without tending what the book or teacher has communicated (Noreen & Majid Khan Rana, 2019).

5.METHODS

According to (Creswell, 2002) identifying a trending problem then explaining why it occurs, the study focuses on which variables influence other variables. The study uses quasi-experimental research with quantitative design. Researchers use pre-test and post-test design for

research instrument. Pre-test and post-test scores of students became the source of the data. The study population was tenth grade high school students in academic year 2022-2023 in MAN 2 Probolinggo. Class A consisting of 14 students was taken as an experimental group, and Class B consisting of 14 students was taken as a control group. Both of them are given same pre-test and same post-test too. The experimental group given a treatment after the pre-test while the control group will not be given a treatment.

After collecting data for the study, the researcher analyzes the data obtained. Data analysis is aimed at testing research hypothesis. According to (Creswell, 2002) a pre-test gives or provides a measure on some attribute or characteristic from researcher for the student in an experiment before the student receive a treatment. So that, pre-test results are used to determine the ability of students to understand the text before the experiment, to determine whether it has been normally distributed and have the same treatment ability and to determine whether there are significant differences or no significant differences. While the post-test according to (Creswell, 2002) states "A post-test is a measure on some attribute or characteristic that is assessed for participants in an experiment after a treatment". That is, the post-test is used to determine the ability of students to understand the text after treatment and test the null hypothesis (Ho) whether it is accepted or rejected. Student score results are calculated using SPSS version 16.0. In both tests (Pre-test and Post-test), students were asked to answer 20 essay questions consisting of several description texts. One text consists of four questions that the student must answer.

4. FINDING AND DISCUSSION

4.1 Finding

This research was conducted by applying quantitative approach with quasi-experimental design. Researchers measured the effectiveness of Reciprocal Teaching Method used in reading descriptive text by using T-test with SPSS software 16.0 version. The hypothesis in this study is formulated as below:

H₀: If there is no significant difference between the students who are taught by using Reciprocal Teaching Method and those who are not taught by using Reciprocal Teaching Method.

H₁: If there is significant difference between the students who are taught by using Reciprocal Teaching Method and those who are not taught by using Reciprocal Teaching Method.

Pre-test and Post-test data of both groups were calculated in the T-test calculation using SPSS version 16.0, a software to determine the difference in significance between the experimental group and the control group. The results of the above data can be seen by the calculation of the T-test below:

Table 01. Statistics Sample T-test

	Mean	N	Std. Deviation	Std. Error Mean
Samp. 1 Pre-test Experimental	70.36	14	5.813	1.553
Post-test Experimental	86.86	14	3.302	.882
Samp. 2 Pre-test Control	68.71	14	6.031	1.612
Post-test Control	77.86	14	4.204	1.123

Table 02. Independent Samples Test

		Levene's for Equality Variances		t-test for Equality of Means						
		F	Sig.	t	df	Sig. (2- tail ed)	Mean Diffe rence	Std. Error Diffe rence	95% Confidence Interval of the Difference Lower Upper	
Student's Score	Equal variances assumed	.523	.476	6.300	26	.000	9.000	1.429	6.064	11.936
	Equal variances not assumed			6.300	24.618	.000	9.000	1.429	6.055	11.945

From the table above, it could be seen the summary result of the pre-test and post-test experimental group and control group. The results showed that the average value of pre-test and post-test experimental group in the first sample amounted to 70.36 (pre-test) and 86.86 (post-test). While the second sample shows that the average value of pre-test and post-test control group is equal to 68.71 (pre-test) and 77.86 (post-test).

Based on the result obtained above, the value of SPSS 16 version output that the p-value post-test of each class is 0.000 (Sig. two tailed). Due to the value of the *p-value* post-test is lower than alpha ($0.000 < 0.05$), So H_0 is pushed away and H_1 is accepted. Indeed, Reciprocal Teaching Method is effective to increase students' reading comprehension in Descriptive text and it is accepted, which means that there are significant differences are likely the scores with of both class post-test score.

4.2 DISCUSSION

The testing for this study was measured using SPSS version 16 with the results showed a p value of 0.000, meaning the p-value is less than alpha

(0.05). It is proved that H_0 is pushed away. Thus, the researcher concluded that reciprocal Teaching Method in teaching are effective to improve students' reading ability in descriptive texts. There is a significant difference between students who are taught using the Reciprocal Teaching Method and students who are not taught using the Reciprocal Teaching Method.

The result of the data analysis presented in previous section showed that the alternative hypothesis that states the students who are taught reading through reciprocal teaching method achieve better in reading comprehension than those who are taught through conventional teaching method. It can be seen from the result of analysis on the post-test, the scores of the experimental group exceed from those of the control group.

The mean score of the experimental group on the reading achievement on the pre-test is 70.36, while in the post-test, the mean score is 80.86. This showed that the achievement of the experimental group after the treatment is higher, that is 10.5 points. This finding is in line with (Oczkus, 2018), reciprocal teaching as an effective practice that improves students reading comprehension. The improvement is reflected in the scores the students' achievement after the implementation of this method.

The improvement on the post test is affected by some reasons. First, the implementation of the reciprocal teaching method is interesting for the students as they never got before. This method needs the students' involvement on every discussion well. Second, the students are more active in discussing the materials because they have their own responsibility in turn so that they try to do their best. They apply every method with predicting, clarifying, questioning, and summarizing within

their group without feeling shy or frightened. Third, they can share ideas within their group without feeling afraid of making mistake because the members of the group help each other to find the solution. At last, the consistent way of teaching makes the students get ease to understand the material because they have the clear steps to do it.

After applying this method, the students get ease to understand the Descriptive text. By doing discussion, sharing ideas and having responsibility to lead the discussion for several meetings. It can be seen from the result of the post-test. If it is compared to the result of their pre-test, they get score improvement.

In contrast, the increase in the average reading achievement of control grade students is still low. The results in the pre-test showed that the average score they achieved was 68.71, while in the post-test they achieved was 77.86. Both the average value is still low than the average value of pre-test and post-test of experimental class. In summary, the findings of this study indicate that reciprocal teaching methods are more effective compared to conventional methods on reading comprehension.

The involvement and effectiveness of the method towards students' understanding is also evidenced by the willingness of students to share ideas among the group and help each other in understanding the reading of the text. In addition, anxiety and shyness can also be reduced because the students work in small groups. When asked to report their work to the whole class, they feel confident because their answers are not only from themselves, but from the whole group.

In conclusion, the findings of this study indicate that reciprocal teaching methods are more effective compared to conventional methods.

5. CONCLUSION

Referring to the result of this research, there are suggestions for English Teachers, especially those who teach reading. Teacher should prepare appropriate teaching strategy, media or technique to increase and develop students' knowledge in the process of English learning. Especially in this study, the researcher used method in it, it is Reciprocal Teaching Method which can increased the students reading comprehension in Descriptive text. During the treatment of this strategy, the students in experimental class more interest and enthusiastic in the learning process. Furthermore, they got easily understand about the material.

REFERENCES

- A. Prayogo, J. (2022). English Language Teaching in Indonesia in the 21st Century: What Needs Reinforcing and Enhancing for the Teachers. *KnE Social Sciences*, 2022, 12-22. <https://doi.org/10.18502/kss.v7i7.10645>
- Afrasiabifar, A., Mehri, Z., & Ghaffarian Shirazi, H. R. (2020). Orem's Self-Care Model with Multiple Sclerosis Patients' Balance and Motor Function. *Nursing Science Quarterly*, 33(1), 46-54. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0894318419881792>
- Annemarie Pallincsar and Anna Brown. (1985). *Reciprocal Teaching: A means to a Meaningful End*. Reading Education: Foundations for a Literate America.
- Cotterall, S. (1990). *Reciprocal Teaching: A Problem-Solving Approach to Reading*. Guidelines a Periodical for Classroom Language Teachers.
- Creswell, J. W. (2002). *Fourth Edition. Educational Research: Planning, Conducting, and Evaluating Quantitative and Qualitative Research*.
- Abrori, A., Hifdil Islam, M., & Hamdani, B | *The effectiveness of Reciprocal Teaching Method on Students' Reading Comprehension in Descriptive text* | 86

Lincoln.

Harmer, J. (1998). *How To Teach English*. Addison Wesley Longman Limited.

Islam, S. (2020). Implementing Reciprocal Teaching Method in Improve the Students' Reading Comprehension Ability. *ETERNAL (English, Teaching, Learning, and Research Journal)*, 6(1), 96. <https://doi.org/10.24252/eternal.v6i1.2020.a9>

Islamiyah, N. H., & Wijaya, S. D. (2019). The Effectiveness of Reciprocal Teaching Strategy to Increase Students Reading Comprehension in Narrative Text. *Tell: Teaching of English Language and Literature Journal*, 7(1), 33. <https://doi.org/10.30651/tell.v7i1.2699>

Mahur, Y., Riyanto, Y., & Roesminingsih, E. (2019). Paulo Freire: Critical, Humanist and Liberating Education (Critical Reflections on Indonesian Education). *International Journal for Educational and Vocational Studies*, 1(8), 873. <https://doi.org/10.29103/ijevs.v1i8.2242>

Moreillon, J. (2007). *Collaborative strategies for teaching reading comprehension : maximizing your impact*.

Noreen, R., & Majid Khan Rana, A. (2019). Activity-Based Teaching versus Traditional Method of Teaching in Mathematics at Elementary Level Activity-Based Teaching versus TM of Teaching in Mathematics at Elementary Level. *Bulletin of Education and Research*, 41(2), 145-159.

Oczkus, L. D. (2018). *Reciprocal Teaching at Work: Powerful Strategies and Lessons for Improving Reading Comprehension*, 3rd Edition. *Ascd*, 365.

Pamela J. Farris, Carol J. Fuhler, M. P. W. (2003). *No Titl Teaching Reading: A Balanced Approach for Today's Classrooms with Litlinks and Making the Gradee* (berilustra). McGraw-Hill Higher Education.

Pangaribuan, M. (2019). The Effect of Reciprocal Teaching Technique on

Abrori, A., Hifdil Islam, M., & Hamdani, B | *The effectiveness of Reciprocal Teaching Method on Students' Reading Comprehension in Descriptive text* | 87

Students' Ability in Reading Comprehension at English Department of FKIP UHN Pematangsiantar. *JETAFL (Journal of English Teaching as a Foreign Language)*, 5(1), 26-36.

Pilonieta, P., & Medina, A. L. (2009). Reciprocal Teaching for the Primary Grades: "We Can Do It, Too!" *The Reading Teacher*, 63(2), 120-129. <https://doi.org/10.1598/rt.63.2.3>

Syaiful Bahri Djamarah, A. Z. (2006). *Strategi Belajar Mengajar* (Ed. rev). Rineka Cipta.

Young, O. R. (2002). Scott Barrett's new book entitled. *Young*, 145-147.